## Moving the UK rail industry beyond compliance to better fatigue management

- Dr Debbie Lucas
- HMRI, ORR
- Royal Aeronautical Society seminar
- 11<sup>th</sup> May 2006





### Plan

- Who are HMRI? What do they do on human factors risks?
- Safety consequences of fatigue in UK rail industry
- Legal duties, guidance and enforcement
- Risk assessment tools and advice to industry



## HM Railway Inspectorate

- Safety regulator for UK railways including mainline, underground railways, light rail, and heritage.
- Enforcement of Health and Safety Law for railways
- Assessment of safety cases, inspection activities
- Investigation of accidents and incidents where may be legal breach
- Influencing dutyholder safety compliance to manage particularly catastrophic risk
- Now moved to Office of Rail Regulation



#### The First Inspector General ...



Lt Col Sir Frederick Smith of the Royal Engineers was appointed to be the first Inspector General of Railways.

First human factors specialist in HMRI in 2003!



#### Human factors in published accidents

- Clapham Junction
  - Fatigue, Staffing Levels
  - Training
  - Culture/ 'Custom and practice'
  - Supervision
  - Communications

- Cannon Street
  - Fitness for work
- Great Heck
  - Fatigue
- Southall
  - Cab warning devices
  - Maintenance
  - 'Culture'
- Severn Tunnel
  - Emergency response



### Ladbroke Grove

- Signal sighting
- Training and route knowledge of driver
- Signaller response
- SMS
- Safety leadership
- Culture









#### Train accident fatalities 1975 - 2004



#### **Perceptions of railway risk**

- MORI survey 2003
- Estimated deaths per year UK train accidents 99
- Estimated deaths per year UK car accidents 527
- Actual mean figures are 5 and 1700



#### **Role of Human Factors specialist inspectors**

- New role created 2003 sending message to industry
- Incident investigation
- Advice to front line inspectors and to industry
- Support to enforcement action including expert witness work
- Advice for 'approvals' work
- Training inspectors on HF topics
- Applied research and development



#### **Clapham Junction Accident 1988**



- Maintainer fatigue was one cause of error
- No system existed for monitoring hours or limiting excessive working
- Led to industry 'Hidden limits'
- What was 'operationally achievable' in 1980s
- Not based on science of sleep and fatigue



#### **GH/RT 4004 Appendix A**

- Railway Group Standard
- Non mandatory limits, (so called Hidden Limits)
  - No more than 12 hours per turn
  - No more than 72 hours per week
  - Minimum of 12 hours between shifts
  - No more than 13 turns in any 14 days
- Railway safety case holders have to comply with group standards
- In practice may authorise 'exceedances'



#### On privatisation of the UK railways: Railway (Safety Critical Work) Regulations 1994 and ACoP



- Competent
- Fit
- Carry identification
- Not extremely fatigued....



#### Railway (Safety Critical Work) Regulations Regulation 4 Hours of Work

- 'Every employer shall ensure, so far as is reasonably practicable, that no employee of his undertakes any safety critical work for such number of hours as would be liable to cause him fatigue which would endanger safety;....'
- Approved Code of Practice (ACoP) set limits, risk assessment, plan breaks, when can exceed, monitoring, etc.



#### Prosecution by HSE vs Amec Rail Ltd & Primat Recruitment Ltd

- Death of safety critical track worker at Purley Oaks 2001
- Had worked max of 46 consecutive 10 hour day shifts
- Companies pleaded guilty and were fined £20,000 each
- The risk of being fatigued regarded seriously by courts



## CIRAS (Confidential reporting) (n=95)







- More use of VDU based tasks
- Better working environments
- More system supervision
- Pay versus working sensible hours issue
- View that compliance with Hidden limits is enough
- Need to educate and inform
- Need to provide tools and guidance for dutyholders



## HSE's Fatigue Index risk assessment tool

- Developed in support of Railway (Safety Critical Work) Regulations 1994
- Assesses daily and cumulative fatigue risks associated with rotating shift work
- How to do a 'fatigue risk assessment' when work patterns change
- As an aid to education/information transfer
- Based on science



## HSE's Fatigue Index

- 5 main factors which impact on fatigue
  - shift start time
  - shift duration
  - length of time between duty spells
  - breaks within duty spells
  - number of consecutive shifts
- Based on a system of rating scales
  - Developed by HF experts at DERA
  - Validated by comparison with MOD data
  - Freely available to all & open to scrutiny



#### **Excel spreadsheet**

Alexandre en este este este este este este este	Fatigue	Index	Cal	culator	and the second					ALCOLOGIES &			
Use 24 hou	r clock, enter	start and finish	time.	e.g. 13:30	midnig	nt = 00:00							a de la composition de la comp
Mark rest d	avs with r in s	tart time colum	n, lea	ve finish time	blank.							estates and	
If second s	hift starts the	same day as th	e last	shift started	mark 1	in column D	DB.		ver	6.32		Contraction of the local	
If work load	t is high mark	4 in Complex	Task d	column	de la com							a service and	
Warning:	do not use "o	cut" and "pas	te" b	ut "copy" an	d "pas	ste" or dele	te key wh	nen enterin	g shift times		Contractor of the		
Company	ANY CO	-		Accossor					Total Sco	ro	152.0		
Company	ANTOO			A3363301	-				No weaking a		40.0		
Location	London				DAL				No working o	lays	10.0		
Group	abc			Comments					Mean Dai	y Score	15.2		
Date	Oct-02				Demo								
Travelling	time (hrs)	0.00	typica	al journey time	to work								
				Complex	Rest		Contract of the			Shift			
Dav	Start Time	Finish Time	DB	Task (0-4)	Dur	E1 Score	Shift Dur	F2 Score	E3 Score E4	Type	E5 Score	Total	
Day	otart mile	i mon ime	D.D.D.	1451 (5 1)	area a	TTOCOIC	Shine Dan	TE Oboie		ALC: NO DE LA COMPANY		- Otal	
1	14:00	22:30	Car Citario		38.00	3.0		1.0	0.0	D	0.0	4.0	
2	14:00	22:30			15,50	3.0	08:30	1.0	0.0	D	0.0	4.0	
3	14:00	22:30			15.50	3.0	08:30	1.0	0.0	D	0.0	4.0	
4	r				1.50	0.0	00.00	0.0	0.0	0	0.0	0.0	
5	r				25 50	0.0	00.00	0.0	0.0	0	0.0	0.0	
6	08:00	16:00			57.50	4.0	08.00	0.0	0.0	D	0.0	4.0	
7	08:00	16:00			16:00	4.0	08:00	0.0	0.0	D	0.0	4.0	
8	08:00	16:00			16:00	4.0	08 00	0.0	0.0	D	0.0	4.0	
9	22:30	08:00			30,50	14.0	09:30	5.0	0.0	N	5.0	24.0	
10	22:30	08:00			14,50	14.0	09:30	5.0	4.0	N	9.0	32.0	
11	22:30	08:00			14.50	14.0	09.30	5.0	4.0	N	12.0	35.0	
12	22:30	08:00			14.50	14.0	09:30	5.0	4.0	N	14.0	37.0	
13	r				-8.00	0.0	00:00	0.0	0.0	0	0.0	0.0	
14	r				16.00	0.0	00.00	0.0	0.0	0	0.0	0.0	
15	Manager and the second second	Constraint and the second									0.0		
16					Cold Co						0.0		
17					and the						0.0		
18					Start Start						0.0		
19					Sector.						0.0		
20					Public of						0.0		
21					Ale out						0.0		
22					Contraction of the						0.0		
23											0.0		
24					Second						0.0		



## Uses of the HSE FI

- Risk assessment when work patterns change
- Profiling duties within a roster which need to be reconsidered
- Post accident to look to see if the work pattern may have contributed
- Selection of staff for overtime duties who would be least fatigued



#### Effect of fatigue on rail incidents



## **Updated Fatigue and Risk Index**

- The FI and the new FRI are based on published scientific literature on fatigue, alertness, sleepiness, and occupational injuries
- The new FRI has been updated to include literature from 1999-2005
- The tool was developed by Qinetiq and Professor Simon Folkard under contract to HSE
- The background report and the new FRI index will be available on HSE's website.



## The FRI

- Contains two indices
- Fatigue Index built on knowledge of factors affecting fatigue and alertness
- Risk Index based on a review of trends in risk related to shift work
- The two are similar in many aspects, but different in others eg time of day
- Users must consider both and treat a high value on either index as needing action



## The 3 components

- In the calculator you see
- Cumulative component relates to fatigue associated with the way duties are put together to form a schedule
- Duty timing component effects of start time, shift length and time of day
- Job type/breaks component content of the shift eg activity undertaken and breaks



	A	В	С	D	E	F	G	Н	E	J	К	L	M	N	0	P	Q
				Fatig	ue Ind	lex Ca	Iculato	7						00	06	12	18
				0.11									à i			<del></del>	
													2	111			
	Company	QinetiQ							Assessor				3		11 11		
	Location	Earnborg	ouah							e Versenaar			4			111 11	111
	shift in	1004						2	🛛 🖾 Displa	y schedule			5				111
	3111110	12.54						8	an relation	e Matana			6	111	11 11	111 11	111
	Date	30 11 05								y criaits		<u></u>	7	111	11 11	111 11	111
	Mode	Entio	10	Do foult c	Dente	halou -	Calculate Index		© Oineti(	PLC 2005		0 la an sh	8			111 11	
		rauge		De Buits	nesei	nuex	calculate index		Version	2.1		ADUUL	9	111	++		
			9					8			Job tupe J		10				<u> </u>
	Day	On Duty	Off Duty	Job type /	Commuting	Duty Length	Rest Length	Average duty	Cumulative	Duty timing	Breaks	Fatigue Index	22	-			
				breaks		1 S S		per day	component	component	component		抢			+++ ++	+++++
	1	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	Fullu Rested	12h	0,1	0.8	1.4	2.3	13		i		
	2	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	12h	1.8	0.8	1.4	4.0	1				111
_	3	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	1d	9h	1.9	17.4	16.8	35.5	15	111	11 11	111 11	111
	4	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	9h 36m 6h 40m	7.8	17.4	16.8	39.4	16	111			
_	10	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	40 12h	7h 12m	2.5	0.8	14	4.6	<b>"</b>				
	11	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	1d	7h	2.2	17.4	16.8	35.7	10		11 11		
	12	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	7h 23m	8.2	17.4	16.8	39.6	20			111 11	111
	17	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	4d	6h 21m	0.5	0.8	1.4	2.7	- 21			111 11	111
_	18	19-00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	IZN 1d	6h 40m Sh 36m	2.5	0.8	1.9	4.7	22	111	11 11	111 11	111
-	20	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 51m	8.2	17.4	16.8	39.6	23			111 11	
	25	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	4d	6h 14m	0.5	0.8	1.4	2.7	24				
_	26	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 28m	2.5	0.8	1.4	4.7	- 25			<u></u>	<u></u>
_	27	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h 12k	1d 126	6h 26m	2.2	17.4	16.8	35.7	26	111	ii 🔯	<u></u>	<u></u>
	33	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	4d	6h 11m	0.2	0.8	1.4	2.7	27	111		111 11	
	34	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 21m	2.5	0.8	1.4	4.7	28				
_	35	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	1d	6h 20m	2.2	17.4	16.8	35.7	29			+++++	
_	36	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 29m	8.2	17.4	16.8	39.6	30	111	++++	+++ ++	+++++
-	42	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	40 12h	6h 17m	2.5	0.8	1.4	4.7	31		++++	+++ ++	+++++
	43	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	1d	6h 16m	2.2	17.4	16.8	35.7	32				
	44	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 24m	8.2	17.4	16.8	39.6	33	111			
_	49	07:00	19:00	Default Default	Default	12h	4d	6h7m	0.5	0.8	1.4	2.7	34	111	11 11		1111
_	50	19-00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12n	6h 14m	2.0	17.4	16.8	35.7	- 35				
_	52	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 20m	8.2	17.4	16.8	39.6	36				111
	57	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	4d	6h 6m	0.5	0.8	1.4	2.7	- 20	111		111 11	1117
_	58	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 12m	2.5	0.8	1.4	4.7			11 11		111
_	53 60	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	10 12h	6h 18m	8.2	17.4	16.8	39.6	39				111
	65	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	4d	6h 6m	0.5	0.8	1.4	2.7	41		11		
	66	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 11m	2.5	0.8	1.4	4.7	42	111			
_	67	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	1d	6h 11m	2.2	17.4	16.8	35.7	43	111	11 11		111
_	58 73	19:00	19-00	Default	Default	12h 12h	12h 4d	6h 16m 6h 5m	8.2	17.4	16.8	39.6	44			111 11	111
_	74	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 10m	2.5	0.8	1.4	4.7	45			111 11	
	75	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	1d	6h 9m	2.2	17.4	16.8	35.7	46				
_	76	19:00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 14m	8.2	17.4	16.8	39.6	47		1111		111
_	81	07:00	19:00	Default	Default	12h	4d	6h 4m	0.5	0.8	1.4	2.7	48	111	11 11	11111	111
_	83	19-00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12n	6h 9m	2.0	17.4	16.8	35.7	49				
-	94	19-00	07:00	Default	Default	12h	12h	6h 13m	8.2	17.4	16.8	39.6	50			<u> </u>	



## Default values: job type, workload, breaks, commuting time

Fatigue / I	Risk Assessment					
Commuting Time What is the typical commuting time of employees to OR fror work (to the nearest 10 minutes): About 0 + hours 40 + mins (Please specify the typical commuting time)	Breaks How frequently (to the nearest 15 mins) are rest breaks typically provided OR taken? Every 2 + hours 0 + mins (please specify the typical interval between breaks)					
Type of Job: Workload   The workload and/or work pace of the job is typically:   Extremely demanding, no spare capacity.   Moderately demanding, little spare capacity.   Moderately undemanding, some spare capacity.   Capacity.   Extremely undemanding, lots of spare capacity.	What is the typical average length of these breaks (to the nearest 5 minutes) that are provided or taken?					
Type of Job: Attention   The job typically requires continuous attention   All or nearly all the time   Most of the time   Some of the time   Rarely or nearly none of the time	What is typically the length of the break taken after this longest period of continuous work (to the nearest 5 minutes)?					



# Risk assessment NOT prescription

- The HSE Fatigue Index (FI) and the new Fatigue and Risk Index (FRI) tools are risk assessment methods
- You should use them to identify where your most serious fatigue risks are
- You should then put suitable and sufficient controls in place, e.g.
  - Altering the work pattern to reduce the risk
  - Or, planning the work differently
  - Or, introducing additional supervision, checks, etc.



#### NEW REGULATIONS Railway and Other Guided Transport Systems Regulations 2006 (ROGS)

- Regulation 25
- Duty on controller of safety critical work to have arrangements in place to ensure, sfairp, that safety critical worker doesn't work when so fatigued (or liable to become so fatigued) that could significantly affect his H&S or that of other persons on transport system
- Duty to review the arrangements when reason to doubt their effectiveness



## Change of approach

- From focus on 'number of hours' (in practice meant compliance with industry standard)
- To 'arrangements' ie management system for fatigue risks
- Recognition that fatigue influenced by hours, work patterns, working environment, nature of task, travelling time, social and domestic factors.
- (Working Time Regs recognise that provisions as applied to UK rail sector not sufficient to prevent person working when so fatigued that could endanger safety)



# New guidance on 'Managing fatigue in safety critical work'

- Based on information from series of HMRI inspections on TOC/FOC companies
- What we know is good practice in UK rail sector
- Should match the majority of what sector currently does
- They will need to review what they currently do against the guidance



#### The 9 stages of a Fatigue Management System

- Identify safety critical workers
- Set standards <u>and</u> <u>design working patterns</u>
- Limit exceedances
- Consult with safety critical workers
- Record the arrangements

- Provide information to safety critical workers
- Monitor arrangements
- <u>Take action when</u> <u>safety critical workers</u> <u>are so fatigued that...</u>
- Review the arrangements when reason to doubt



# Designing shift patterns – good practice principles

- Minimise build up of fatigue – restrict no of consecutive nights/very early starts
- Plan adequate rest between shifts and blocks of shifts – allows fatigue to dissipate
- Plan work patterns to minimise sleep disturbance





## Conclusions

- Increasing awareness of need to manage fatigue in safety critical workers
- Widespread use of Fatigue Index tool
- Moving slowly from compliance to 'management system'
- Planned diagrams are better actual hours work often differ significantly
- HMRI inspectors raise issue in investigations
- Working with industry to advise and encourage.



## Debbie.Lucas@orr.gsi.gov.uk

